ON05749

WORKING PAPERS OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT RESEARCH

TVOntario

90-6

Number

CREDENTIALISM: PARTNERS FOR BUSINESS EDUCATION

Title

Maria Protz

Author

August 1990

Date

92-06377/

TVOntario

Planning and Development Research
Planification et recherche en développement

Working Paper 90-6

CREDENTIALISM:
PARTNERS FOR BUSINESS EDUCATION

by

Maria Protz

August 1990

Director, Planning and Development Research : Judith Tobin
© The Ontario Educational Communications Authority

INDEX

SUMMARY.....iii

RÉSUMÉ.....vii

INTRODUCTION.....1

RECOMMENDATIONS.....5

PARTNERSHIP OPTIONS.....7

ASSOCIATION RESPONSES:

Interest and Need for Broadcast Education..... 14

PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS IN FORMING PARTNERSHIPS.....27

CREDENTIALISM.....35

CONCLUSIONS.....41

APPENDICES.....43

I CONTACT LIST.....45

II REFERENCES.....47

III BIBLIOGRAPHY.....49

SUMMARY

This report examines the current value of credentialism and extends the findings of a previous report, *Business Training: Content, Enrolment and Delivery,* also by Planning and Development Research. The report acknowledges the distinction between various types of credentials, but focuses primarily on professional business certification and investigates the potential for TVOntario to form partnerships with business associations in order to enhance the educational opportunities leading to professional designations.

The findings were established through telephone interviews with several professional business associations. Two universities, which provide courses that are then approved by the associations for their advanced fellowship certification were also consulted. A literature review provided an understanding of the current value of various credentials.

The report makes a distinction between **specialized** courses and **generic** business courses. **Specialized** courses are related to the specific industries the individual associations represent. These courses are offered at introductory, intermediate, and advanced levels directly by the associations. **Generic** business courses are the traditional business courses such as finance, accounting, marketing and so on, that are common to the advanced fellowship and associateship programs of most associations. Generic courses are not delivered by the associations, but are offered by universities and community colleges with association approval.

Three main options for pursuing partnerships with professional associations are suggested in the report. These three best options were determined by analyzing the educational needs and interests of the associations in conjunction with the practical implications which their needs and interests pose for TVOntario. Each option corresponds to a different educational level. The first includes bilateral partnerships for specialized introductory and intermediate programs. The second also involves bilateral partnerships to support highly specialized and advanced subject areas. The third option is a bilateral arrangement not with the associations directly, but with a university or community college that offers the generic business courses they approve.

The report's key findings are organized as follows:

Association Responses: Interest and Need for Broadcast Education

- A high level of interest and enthusiasm exists among both finance and nonfinance based associations.
- Several associations require national program distribution.
- Most associations do not demand a degree as an entrance requirement.
- Associations view university-affiliated courses as having higher academic status than comparative courses offered by colleges.
- The student market size is sufficient for programming.
- Advanced specialized courses would benefit greatly from a television methodology.
- Possibility of a television methodology is very timely for many of the associations.
- At this point, production costs do not seem to be an obstacle to further negotiations with most of the associations.
- Most associations rely on correspondence courses (print and audio-cassette based) with optional classroom lectures. Television would greatly enhance these courses, especially for learners in rural or northern areas.
- Broadcasts which utilize a case study methodology and show sophisticated graphics are desirable.
- The need for improved interactive support is as high or higher than the need for television alone.
- The associations share the opinion that television would attract a larger student audience to their educational programs.
- Universities that offer approved courses for associateship and fellowship programs are interested in forming partnerships with TVOntario.
- TVOntario has a credible reputation as a supplier of business programming.
- However, affiliation with a university or other market consensus leader would enhance TVOntario's position as a supplier of business education programming.

Practical Implications in Forming Partnerships

- Student numbers influence the market size for business education broadcasting. The largest student markets are found in the specialized introductory and intermediate programs and in some specialized advanced courses. Large markets for generic courses also exist if student numbers for the associateship and fellowship levels are taken collectively.

- The associations' national responsibilities require arrangements for national broadcast distribution and French language programming.

- The preference for courses with university affiliation and perceived university academic status implies that any broadcasting to be developed would be more marketable, if affiliated with a university.

- Certain generic business courses are required by most of the associateship and fellowship programs of the different associations, while other courses are in less demand. The demand for generic courses may affect TVOntario's choices in program development.

- The demand for interactive support implies that TVOntario may be expected to work directly with associations to provide interactive services.

- Flexiblity is also required so that the same programs can be used by both correspondence learners and in-class students. The role of the in-class instructor, course revision requirements, and instructional design preferences are all factors affecting program flexibility.

- Different associations will have different administrative and organizational capacities which may affect TVOntario's choice of partners. Ability to share production costs will also vary among the associations, and alternative sources of funding support may be necessary.

- The considerable level of enthusiasm and the timeliness of the research indicates a strong demand for business broadcasting that requires a quick response.

Credentialism

- For the most part, credentialism is still defined very narrowly in many formal postsecondary education circles. University credentials are perceived to have higher educational value than college credentials.

- However, postsecondary educators are also recognizing that community college credentials are currently underrated in the workplace. As a result, changes to the community college education system are being proposed by the provincial *Vision 2000* investigation. These changes would allow students to pursue a combination of college and university credits that would better prepare them for the marketplace.

- At the same time, employers still prefer university credentials to credentials from community colleges.

- The literature shows that there is a difference between the type of credentials pursued by the majority of full-time students and that of part-time learners. High full-time university enrolment rates indicate that the majority of those individuals with the option of studying full-time prefer degree credentials.

- Greater numbers of part-time adult learners are enrolled in the continuing education courses of community colleges.

- Professional associations also assign greater status to courses offered by universities than they do to courses of community colleges.

RÉSUMÉ

Ce rapport étudie la valeur actuellement attachée à la sanction des études et il élargit les conclusions d'un rapport antérieur, également dressé par la Planification et recherche en développement, sous le titre *Business Training: Content, Enrolment and Delivery*. Ce rapport établit des distinctions entre les divers types de sanctions mais il s'étend principalement sur l'agrément professionnel et sur la possibilité, pour TVOntario, de créer des partenariats avec des associations professionnelles dans le but d'accroître les possibilités d'études conduisant à l'obtention d'un agrément professionnel.

Les conclusions qu'il présente sont fondées sur des entretiens téléphoniques avec diverses associations professionnelles. Deux universités offrant des cours qui sont par la suite approuvés par les associations dans le cadre de leurs programmes d'agrément de cycle supérieur ont également été consultées. Pour mieux comprendre la valeur actuellement attachée aux divers types de sanction des études, la documentation existante sur cette question a également été consultée.

Le rapport établit une distinction entre les cours **spécialisés** et les cours de gestion des affaires **généraux**. Les cours **spécialisés** traitent de sujets intéressant plus particulièrement les entreprises que l'association représente. Ils sont offerts par l'association elle-même au premier cycle et aux cycles intermédiaire et supérieur. Quant aux cours **généraux**, ce sont les cours traditionnels -- finances, comptabilité, marketing, etc. -- qui sont exigés pour les programmes de reconnaissance professionnelle supérieure de la plupart des associations. Ces cours ne sont pas donnés par les associations, mais par les universités et les collèges communautaires, avec l'approbation de l'association concernée.

Le rapport suggère trois grandes options pour créer des partenariats avec les associations professionnelles. Ces trois options privilégiées ont été définies en analysant les besoins et les intérêts des associations en matière d'éducation et en les rapprochant des incidences pratiques qu'ils peuvent avoir pour TVOntario. Chaque option correspond à un niveau d'enseignement différent. La première vise des partenariats bilatéraux pour des programmes de premier cycle et de cycle intermédiaire spécialisés. La deuxième comporte aussi des partenariats bilatéraux, visant des programmes de cycle supérieur et très spécialisés. Enfin, la troisième option serait une entente bilatérale passée, non pas avec les associations elles-mêmes, mais avec une université ou un collège communautaire offrant des cours de gestion des affaires généraux approuvés par les associations.

Les principales conclusions du rapport sont organisées comme suit :

Réaction des associations : intérêts et besoins de formation télédiffusée

- Les associations de caractère financier et les autres associations manifestent toutes un vif intérêt et beaucoup d'enthousiasme pour de telles émissions.
- Plusieurs associations ont besoin de programmes diffusés à l'échelle nationale.
- La plupart des associations n'exigent aucun diplôme préalable.
- Les associations considèrent que les cours dispensés avec l'appui d'une université ont plus de prestige que les cours du même genre offerts par les collèges communautaires.
- Le marché des étudiants est assez important pour justifier de telles émissions.
- Les cours spécialisés de cycle supérieur bénéficieraient largement du recours à la télévision.
- Le recours à la télévision viendrait à point nommé aux yeux de beaucoup d'associations.
- Pour le moment, les coûts de production ne semblent pas constituer un obstacle à des négociations plus poussées avec la plupart des associations.
- La plupart des associations utilisent des cours par correspondance (documentation sur papier et audiocassettes) avec, en option, instruction en classe. La télévision améliorerait considérablement ces cours, surtout pour les étudiants des régions rurales ou septentrionales.
- Les émissions utilisant une méthodologie fondée sur des études de cas et présentant des graphiques complexes seraient très utiles.
- Des appuis interactifs améliorés seraient aussi utiles ou même plus utiles que le recours à la télévision seule.
- Les associations partagent l'avis que la télévision attirerait un plus grand nombre d'étudiants vers leurs programmes de formation.
- Les universités qui offrent des cours approuvés dans le cadre des programmes d'agrément professionnel seraient intéressées à créer des partenariats avec TVOntario.
- TVOntario jouit d'une réputation satisfaisante en tant que diffuseur d'émissions d'affaires.

- Toutefois, l'affiliation à une université ou à un autre établissement reconnu sur le marché renforcerait la réputation de TVOntario en tant que diffuseur d'émissions de formation professionnelle.

Incidences pratiques de la constitution de partenariat

- L'ampleur de la population étudiante est importante à considérer pour les émissions de formation professionnelle. Les marchés les plus vastes sont ceux qui visent les programmes de premier cycle et de cycle intermédiaire spécialisés ainsi que certains cours spécialisés de cycle supérieur. Il existe également d'importants débouchés pour les cours généraux si l'on considère le nombre global d'étudiants recherchant un agrément professionnel.
- Ayant des responsabilités nationales, les associations veulent des ententes comportant une diffusion nationale et des émissions en français.
- La préférence attribuée aux cours offerts en collaboration avec une université et la réputation des cours universitaires sont telles que les émissions seraient plus faciles à commercialiser si elles étaient offertes en collaboration avec une université.
- Certains cours de gestion des affaires généraux sont exigés pour la plupart des programmes d'agrément professionnel offerts par les diverses associations, tandis que certains autres cours sont moins demandés. La demande pour les cours généraux pourra influer sur les choix des émissions que TVOntario décidera de diffuser.
- Le besoin d'appuis interactifs sous-tend que TVOntario devra peut-être collaborer directement avec les associations pour fournir de tels services.
- Les émissions devront aussi être conçues avec une certaine souplesse de façon à pouvoir être utilisées aussi bien pour les cours par correspondance qu'en classe. La souplesse des émissions dépend notamment du rôle de l'animateur en classe, des besoins de révision des cours et des préférences en matière de conception de l'enseignement.
- Les moyens d'action administratifs et organisationnels pourront varier d'une association à l'autre, et ce fait pourra influer sur le choix des partenaires de TVOntario. La mesure dans laquelle les associations pourront participer au coût de

production variera également; peut-être faudra-t-il trouver d'autres sources de financement.

- L'enthousiasme considérable qui a été observé et le fait que ce sondage a été considéré comme venant à point nommé suggèrent une forte demande pour des émissions d'affaires, à laquelle il faudrait réagir rapidement.

Sanction des études

- Le plus souvent, la sanction des études reste définie avec beaucoup d'étroitesse dans de nombreux milieux de l'enseignement postsecondaire. Les sanctions décernées par les universités sont considérées comme ayant une valeur plus élevée que celles des collèges communautaires.
- Néanmoins, les éducateurs du niveau postsecondaire reconnaissent également que les sanctions décernées par les collèges communautaires sont actuellement sous-estimées dans les milieux du travail. C'est d'ailleurs pourquoi l'enquête provinciale *Vision 2000* propose d'apporter au système d'enseignement des collèges des changements permettant aux élèves de combiner des cours à unité collégiaux et des cours à unité universitaires qui les prépareraient mieux pour le marché du travail.
- Par contre, les employeurs préfèrent encore les sanctions d'études universitaires à celles décernées par les collèges communautaires.
- La documentation de base indique qu'il existe une différence entre les types de sanction recherchés respectivement par la plupart des étudiants à plein temps et par les étudiants à temps partiel. La forte proportion des inscriptions à plein temps dans les universités indique que la majorité des personnes qui sont en mesure d'étudier à plein temps préfèrent recevoir ce genre de sanctions.
- La majorité des étudiants adultes à temps partiel sont inscrits à des cours d'éducation permanente offerts par les collèges communautaires.
- Les associations professionnelles attachent aussi un prestige plus grand aux cours offerts par les universités qu'à ceux que proposent les collèges communautaires.

INTRODUCTION

This report, *Credentialism: Partners for Business Education,* examines the current value of credentialism in part-time, postsecondary education. The report acknowledges the distinction between various types of credentials, but focusses primarily on professional business certification and investigates the potential for TVOntario to develop partnerships with various professional business associations in order to enhance the educational opportunities leading to accredited professional designations.

Professional status in business is usually acquired through the completion of official certificates, diplomas or degree programs. In the past, TVOntario has been involved in the broadcasting of accredited university courses in such subjects as psychology and sociology. One of the main purposes of this report was to gauge the level of interest among professional associations for a similiar broadcast methodology for courses leading to professional certification, and to identify the key potential partners that would be most interested in forming joint-production ventures with TVOntario.

The report makes a distinction between **specialized** courses and **generic** business courses. **Specialized** courses are related to the specific industries the individual associations represent. For example, accounting associations offer courses specifically related to specialized accounting services. Associations affiliated with the travel industry, on the other hand, offer courses such as computerized travel booking, visa requirements, travel insurance regulations, and so on. These types of specialized courses are offered at introductory, intermediate, and advanced levels directly by the associations. **Generic** business subjects are the traditional business courses of finance, accounting, and marketing that are common to the advanced fellowship and associateship programs of most associations. Generic courses are not delivered by the associations, but are offered by universities and community colleges with association approval.

The report suggests three distinct partnership options that TVOntario may choose to pursue with professional associations. The options were established by analysing the educational needs and interests of the associations in conjunction with the practical implications which these needs and interests pose for TVOntario. The advantages and disadvantages of each option are described and potential key partners are listed.

Two additional sections in the report form the information base from which the three partnership approaches were developed. One section provides a profile of the various associations based on their interview responses. The third section discusses the practical implications for TVOntario in more detail.

The fourth section outlines the broad definition of credentialism that was applied in the study and discusses the ways in which the value of credentialism is changing for adult learners, employers, and educators in the postsecondary system.

A final section presents the report's conclusions. Appendices include a list of the associations contacted, references, and a bibliography of all the sources used.

RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

To determine the feasibility and potential for TVOntario to develop cooperative programming for business education, four broad objectives were established. These objectives are not exclusive, but were established to systematize and facilitate analysis:

- To determine the current value of various credentials.
- To describe professional associations that currently offer professional business training and to determine their level of interest in educational broadcasting.
- To identify the practical implications that may be involved in developing cooperative programming.
- To determine various partnership options and to suggest the most appropriate partners for each option.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A two-stage research process was followed. The first involved a literature review to investigate the value of credentialism, and to develop a working definition for the study's interview process and for TVOntario's program planning purposes.

The second stage involved telephone interviews with a variety of professional associations. A total of 19 associations were initially contacted, but it was found that only 17 were relevant to the research focus. Two universities and one non-professional association were also contacted. All of the contacts are listed below:

Professional Business Associations Contacted:

1. Administrative Management Society
2. Canadian Institute of Certified Administrative Managers
3. Canadian Institute of Credit and Financial Management
4. Canadian Credit Union Institute
5. Canadian Institute of Customs House Brokers
6. Canadian Institute of Management
7. Canadian Institute of Traffic and Transportation
8. Canadian Institute of Travel Counsellors
9. Certified General Accountants Association of Ontario
10. Institute of Canadian Bankers
11. Institute of Chartered Accountants of Ontario
12. Insurance Institute of Canada Fellowship Program
13. Ontario Real Estate Association
14. Personnel Association of Ontario
15. Purchasing Management Association of Canada
16. Society of Management Accountants
17. Trust Companies Institute

Additional Contacts:

18. Institute of Public Administration of Canada
19. Independent Study Programme, University of Toronto
20. Office for Continuing Education, Windsor University

Since the investigation constitutes a preliminary stage of research, an open-ended interview approach was used and the preliminary nature of the research was clearly explained to all of the respondents. This was important so as not to raise the expectations of the various associations with respect to TVOntario's eventual programming direction.

Respondents were questioned about:

- their existing programs
- the size of their student membership
- the number of people who annually complete their programs
- their use of educational media
- their reasons for interest in a television methodology
- their key subject courses that would benefit from a televised methodology
- their concerns about using television for accredited education
- the value they place on university education
- their image of TVOntario as a provider of business programs and
- their level of interest in cooperating with TVOntario to develop business programming

RECOMMENDATIONS

The individual sections in this report describe courses in which there is substantial interest on the part of professional associations as well as sufficient student market size. The recommendations presented here have been condensed from the key findings of each section, and form practical suggestions for planning consideration:

1. Because of the timeliness of this research, sufficient student markets, and the high level of interest and enthusiasm shown by the associations, TVOntario should **respond quickly** to pursue partnerships for the production of broadcasting that leads to professional business designations.

2. It would be easiest, however, for TVOntario to begin first with cooperative productions for **generic correspondence courses** (Option #3). The generic subjects with the most demand are: *accounting, financial management, business law* and *economics*.

3. The value of different credentials is changing. Enrolment trends reveal that demand is currently higher for nondegree credentials. At the same time, university affiliated status is still desired by most professional associations. Programming will have to consider these contradictory expectations and the recommendations made by the *Vision 2000* investigation into the province's community college education system.

4. To ensure the best **marketing position** possible, however, broadcasts should have some type of **university academic status**. This could mean either direct affiliation with a university and/or the well-publicized use of known university faculty and experts as researchers and writers in the production. This will also ensure that the productions are flexible, and as suitable as possible for use by both colleges and universities.

5. The **instructional design** of all broadcasts should respect the **visual preferences** of the associations: case study approaches, sophisticated graphics, few talking heads, and so on. The programs should also be designed with a professional tone that respects the business experience of adult learners.

6. The **instructional design** of the productions should also facilitate student-instructor/tutor interaction and be **flexible** enough to work with a variety of **interactive** supports, particularly teleconferencing. For example, this could be achieved through phone-in sessions before, after, or during the broadcasts.

7. The ways in which the **national mandates** of the associations correspond to, and support, the proposal for a **national educational television network** should be explored more fully.

PARTNERSHIP OPTIONS

Based on the findings from the interviews, three main partnership options or approaches were established and are outlined in this section. The different options correspond to the different educational program levels provided by the associations. Two options involve the development of productions for specialized courses. One deals with broadcast programs for generic subjects. They are not meant to be mutually exlusive, but are listed separately in order to distinguish the practical implications, advantages, and disadvantages that are involved in each choice. (The second and third sections of this report provide the more in-depth information needed for a complete understanding of these options).

Option #1: Partnerships for Specialized Introductory and Intermediate Educational Programs

Involves one-on-one partnerships with individual associations to produce broadcast courses that support their specialized introductory and intermediate educational programs.

Many associations offer their own introductory and intermediate educational programs to provide students with the specialized knowledge needed for initial professional practice in their industry. The specific content of these educational programs depends on the industry involved, but each could be enhanced through a televised methodology.

Potential Partners: Almost all of the associations could be potential partners for this type of option based on the size of their student numbers. Other factors, such as the association's interest level, willingness to discuss production costs, and so on, should also be considered. The following associations satisfy these factors and are therefore suggested as potential partners for this option. Chart #1 lists their corresponding student numbers. (Note: the list includes the total number of students currently enrolled in all educational levels, and not only at the introductory and intermediate levels. Numbers for each level were not available. However, most associations reported that the **majority** of their students are enrolled in the introductory and intermediate levels so the totals have been listed under Option #1. All numbers are national totals unless the association's title specifies it as an Ontario body only).

Chart #1: Total Student Numbers for Each Association

Association	Student Number
• Canadian Institute of Credit and Financial Management	700
• Canadian Institute of Customs House Brokers	820
• Canadian Institute of Management	2,000
• Canadian Institute of Traffic and Transportation	800
• Canadian Institute of Travel Counsellors	1,000
• Certified General Accountants Association of Ontario	8,000
• Insurance Institute of Canada	3,000
• Ontario Real Estate Association	25,000
• Personnel Association of Ontario	6,200
• Purchasing Management Association of Canada	7,000
• Society of Management Accountants	10,000
• Trust Companies Institute	1,200

Advantages

- Courses can be designed directly with individual associations and therefore have only to meet their respective academic requirements and standards.
- Print-based correspondence courses are already well established for these levels, and most would be enhanced by accompanying weekly broadcasts. This was a need expressed by many associations, especially as a way to better serve students in remote, rural areas.
- Educational television is a very timely interest for most of these groups.

- Bilateral cooperation also means that the instructional design of the programs can be tailored to meet specific needs.

- A one-on-one partnership may involve less organizational work for TVOntario compared to the organizational effort that would be required to satisfy a group of associations such as that described in Option #3.

Disadvantages

- Although the associations state that a television component would greatly enhance the introductory and intermediate courses they now offer through correspondence, student access to these courses is not as problematic as it is for more specialized courses because most introductory and intermediate courses are also offered through community colleges and universities. Access is more of a problem for the more advanced specialized courses. Therefore, less financial support may be available from the associations for introductory and intermediate programming.

- The added option of televised courses will require the associations to develop further administrative and interactive support. Some associations may not be able to meet these added responsibilities.

- The associations may expect substantial involvement of TVOntario in ensuring that interactive mechanisms and supports are provided.

- Productions would be suitable just for the needs of the specific association for which they are designed and not for other educational programs. Nor are they likely to be of interest to wider TVOntario audiences.

Option #2: Partnerships for Advanced Specialized Courses

Involves one-on-one partnerships with individual associations to develop broadcasting for advanced subjects that are highly specialized.

After the completion of the introductory and intermediate course offerings, many associations also offer additional courses for advanced practice in their industries. Some of the associations identified very specific advanced course needs where a televised methodology would be particularly beneficial for their student members.

Potential Partners: The following associations have identified advanced specialized courses that could benefit greatly from a television methodology:

- *Canadian Institute of Customs House Brokers*: Changing trade agreements and their impact on customs
- *Canadian Institute of Travel Counsellors*: The impact of the Goods and Services Tax (GST) on the travel industry
- *Institute of Chartered Accountants of Ontario*: Advanced accounting and taxation
- *Ontario Real Estate Association*: Real estate appraisal, ethics in real estate, agency law, the impact of the GST on the real estate industry
- *Canadian Institute of Bankers* and the *Trust Company Institute*: Decentralization of banking in Canada and international banking systems

Advantages

- Greater access to specialized courses was identified as a high educational priority by a number of associations and, therefore, more financial support may be available for productions in these subjects.

- As in the case of introductory level courses, specialized courses can be designed directly with individual associations and, therefore, have to meet only their academic requirements and standards.

- Correspondence courses are already well established for specialized courses and many of these would be enhanced by accompanying weekly broadcasts.

Disadvantages

- The above list of potential partners for this option includes those which are thought to have sufficient student markets to support the production costs of a singular, specialized program. However, the actual student market sizes would have to be determined on a case by case basis in a more formal negotiation process.

- Advanced and specialized courses will be even less applicable to other asssociations, and of less interest to wider TVOntario audiences.

Option #3: Partnerships for Fellowship and Associateship Programs

TVOntario could form partnerships with one or more formal educational institutions (colleges and universities) that offer traditional, generic business courses approved by several of the associations towards their fellowship and associateship programs.

In addition to courses which are specifically related to the various industries represented by each association, there are a number of generic business courses (introductory accounting, business strategy, marketing, and so on) that are common to all the associations. Most of these courses are included in associateship or fellowship programs and are offered through the continuing education programs of community colleges and universities. TVOntario could establish partnerships with one or more of these continuing education programs in order to develop broadcast courses in these generic subject areas.

Potential Partners: The *Independent Study Program* at the University of Toronto was the main contact in this study and may be considered as a potential partner for this option. However, several other colleges and universities also offer similiar programs. It would be important to compare the continuing education programs of other colleges and universities as well.

Advantages

- While the student numbers for fellowship or associateship programs are limited on an individual association basis, the total student market is substantial if the students from all the associations are considered collectively. Thirteen of the 17 associations in this study have some type of affiliation with a college or university and approve those courses for their advanced level programs.

- A national distribution mandate is again required or should be sought.

- More financial support for programming may be generated through collective funding from all the associations and other groups.

- If TVOntario were to collaborate directly with recognized educational institutions that are already affiliated with a number of associations, there would likely be less administrative work for TVOntario.

- Interactive supports are already in place. While the educational institutions may wish to improve these supports and may seek TVOntario's assistance in doing so, the existence of initial interactive mechanisms means that any programs that are produced for broadcasting already have an established system for assisting and evaluating students.

- Generic business courses are subject to less revision than are more specialized courses so programming produced for these courses will not become obsolete as quickly.

- Generic courses will also be of interest to wider TVOntario audiences and to other associations that perhaps do not yet have fellowship or associateship programs.

Disadvantages

- Although the actual partnership would only have to involve one other educational institution i.e., either a community college or a university continuing education program which has final academic control over course content, the fact that the productions would be for courses approved by several associations implies potentially complex cooperation to ensure that all associations do in fact approve the broadcast content for credit. This complexity should be anticipated.

- The timing of broadcasts would have to be coordinated with in-class lecture schedules.

- Courses will have to be designed to fit the existing interactive mechanisms and those supports which are anticipated in the future.

ASSOCIATION RESPONSES:
INTEREST AND NEED FOR BROADCAST EDUCATION

This section describes the associations in detail and provides additional information which is necessary to consider for joint partnership cooperation.

Key Findings:

- A high level of interest and enthusiasm exists among both finance and nonfinance based associations.
- Several associations require national program distribution.
- Most associations do not demand a degree as an entrance requirement.
- Associations view university-affiliated courses as having higher academic status than comparative courses offered by colleges.
- The student market size is sufficient for programming.
- Advanced specialized courses would benefit greatly from a television methodology.
- Possibility of a television methodology is very timely for many of the associations.
- At this point, production costs do not seem to be an obstacle to further negotiations with most of the associations.
- Most associations rely on correspondence courses (print and audio-cassette based) with optional classroom lectures. Television would greatly enhance these courses, especially for learners in rural or northern areas.
- Broadcasts which utilize a case study methodology and show sophisticated graphics are desirable.
- The need for improved interactive support is as high or higher than the need for television alone.

- The associations share the opinion that television would attract a larger student audience to their educational programs.

- Universities that offer approved courses for associateship and fellowship programs are interested in forming partnerships with TVOntario.

- TVOntario has a credible reputation as a supplier of business programming.

- However, affiliation with a university or other market consensus leader would enhance TVOntario's position as a supplier of business education programming.

Business Focus

A total of 19 business associations were contacted for the study, but only 17 were relevant to the focus of the research. Of these, eight were primarily **financially-based** (defined as dealing mostly with the administration and monitoring of money); eight were **nonfinance** based (focussed on administration, management, personnel, travel, and so on). One organization, the *Society of Management Accountants*, has both finance and nonfinance based activities.

Level of Interest and Enthusiasm

All of the associations responded quite favorably to the idea of talking further with TVOntario about the potential for joint partnerships and productions. Very **enthusiastic** responses were received from 11 associations. Four said that they would certainly **welcome further inquiries** on the matter, while two were more **moderate** in their responses.

Timeliness

Seven associations said that this inquiry was very **timely** as far as their own educational planning processes are concerned. A few said that they have been wanting to approach TVOntario about this matter. Others said that they were currently investigating a variety of educational media with a view to enhancing their programs, and that television was one of the key media now under consideration.

Student Market Size

The total number of current student members for all program levels varies greatly among the different associations. Five associations reported total student members of less than 1,000 for all their program levels. Seven associations had between 1,000 and 4,000 student members, and another five associations had more than 4,000 student members throughout all levels. Student numbers were not available for two of the associations. However, at least two of these groups had more than 10,000 student members distributed nationally.

Geographical Coverage

The **geographical mandate** of the associations also varied. Five were **provincial** bodies, but 12 were **national** associations which have responsibilities to serve their member chapters throughout the country. Two of these are also **international** associations with interests outside of Canada.

National associations have a responsibility to serve all their members equally. Four associations reported that it would be difficult for them to participate in a joint venture with TVOntario, if that involved production of programming that would be provided only to their Ontario members. They would like to consider ways of providing the same educational broadcast opportunities to their members in other parts of the country — either through **video** options or negotiations with **other broadcasters**.

Perspective on Degree Requirements

Sixteen of the 17 associations contacted said that at present, a university degree was not a mandatory entrance requirement for their programs. For one association, the *Trust Company Institute*, students must have either a college diploma or a university degree to begin the educational program. Three associations have been **considering making a university degree** a mandatory requirement, but are trying to introduce the idea over a period of time in order not to affect students already enrolled in their programs.

However, a preference for university academic status was revealed. Although degrees are not yet a specific entrance requirement in many cases, 13 associations nevertheless described all their courses as having university level academic content, and stated that their students are made aware that they will have to meet **university level academic standards** in the program. The associations, therefore, do attach a higher value to courses that are affiliated with universities or designed by university faculty members or in some other way viewed as of high academic quality.

Types of Educational Programs

It was difficult to classify the educational programs which the various associations offer because they each have different levels and different types of programs. At least 12 have **more than one** educational level leading to different qualifications. Nevertheless, some general patterns were distinguished. (Chart #2 indicates the types of educational programs provided or recognized by the various associations).

A number of associations described their **introductory** educational level as consisting of one or two correspondence courses that provide an overview of their industry and the potential career opportunities it involves. Other associations in the travel and customs brokerage professions have an introductory **first year** program which, when completed, qualifies graduates to work at a level similar to that of a technician.

CHART #2: TYPES OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS

(Note: This table indicates the general types of educational programs offered by the associations contacted.)

Level	Delivery Mode	Student Numbers
Introductory		
• One or two courses that introduce students to the industry and profession	Print correspondence produced by the association	Small numbers in each association
AND/OR		
• A one- or two-year program that leads to an initial recognized qualification	Mostly correspondence but also optional in-class lectures by association instructors	Large numbers in each association
Intermediate		
• A number of required courses leading to a recognized professional designation with a 4-hour final examination. A pass constitutes the major qualification needed to practice in the field	Correspondence and/or in-class lectures (produced by associations, and classes taught by association-hired lecturers, in rented classroom space)	Large numbers in each association but less than in the introductory levels
Advanced		
• Fellowship or Associateship programs that involve completion of many traditional or generic business courses (economics, finance, accounting, marketing, and so on)	Courses taught directly by colleges and universities through their own programs, but approved by the associations; both classroom or correspondence options	Small numbers in eachindividual association, but collectively large for some subjects
PLUS		
• Advanced or specialized courses which are industry specific (examples: ethics in real estate, advanced accounting, and so on).	Print correspondence produced directly by each association	In most cases, very small numbers but in some cases, such as in real estate, the numbers are large.
Continuing Education or Professional Development Courses		
• Short-term seminars, workshops, and so on to keep members up-to-date with changes in their industry and profession	Taught directly by associations through correspondence or lectures	Small numbers, association specific

Intermediate level programs were described as the **qualifying program** for professional certification for most of the associations. (The only exception was the *Institute of Chartered Accountants of Ontario* which requires members to have a university degree). The intermediate courses are offered either through correspondence or through classroom lectures in rented space at community colleges. Final examinations act as the main evaluation method for the qualification that allows both introductory and intermediate students to practice in their fields.

In addition, a number of associations also have **advanced** associateship or fellowship programs that go beyond preparing students for professional practice. The additional programs generally include more **generic** university level courses such as: accounting, business organization, commerical or business law, economics and finance, and so on. These courses are prepared and taught by universities and colleges but are approved by various associations. This leads to a more **general business education,** although students are often also expected to complete a thesis or major paper of original research related to their own industry. Many of the associations described these associateship and fellowship programs as being equivalent to a Masters degree or a Ph.D. in their industry.

A number of associations reported that they offer regular **continuing education** and **professional development** opportunities for their members through a variety of short-term seminars and workshops.

Not surprisingly, most of the associations stated that their **student enrolment numbers declined** with the progressive levels of education. Entry-level and introductory programs had the highest levels of enrolment. In the cases where intermediate programs culminate in professional working designations, the enrolment numbers decline somewhat for the advanced associateship and fellowship levels, but overall still remain substantial. Although the associateship and fellowship programs represent declining enrolments for most of the individual associations, collectively the numbers of students (estimated annually to be between 11,000 and 13,000 nationally) from all associations taking these courses is relatively substantial.

Delivery Mode and Educational Media Mix

Five of the associations contacted offer programs on their own only as correspondence courses. The twelve other associations offer the option of either classroom instruction or correspondence courses for their own courses. The choice of correspondence or classroom instruction also exists at the associateship and fellowship levels, where the courses are offered through the continuing education departments at colleges and universities rather than directly by the associations.

Revision Procedures

No consistency exists on the time frame which these associations employ for course revision. Four of the associations stated that they continually revise courses to ensure that students remain up-to-date with the various changes happening in their industry. Two associations said that they rarely revise courses. One reported revising print materials every three years, while another conducts major revisions every four or five years.

The associations are more involved in revising the **introductory** and **intermediate** courses which they are directly responsible for developing and administering. They have some **input** into the **advanced** associateship or fellowship courses which they have approved, but by and large respect the abilities of the universities and colleges in this regard.

Specific Educational Needs

When asked in what ways or in what subjects television could be most useful for their programs, most of the associations had a number of responses. While five associations stated that broadcasting would enhance all their courses, most responses could be organized in two ways: **delivery or access** requirements and **course or subject** matter requirements.

With respect to developing better **delivery or access** for their members, nine associations said that a broadcast or televised methodology would greatly enhance their existing correspondence courses. This is not surprising since both the introductory level and intermediate level programs rely largely on correspondence courses using only the medium of print. Drop out rates were reported to be high for many of these courses. Students apparently have a difficult time staying with correspondence courses, when there is nothing but their own motivation to complete the work. Weekly broadcast courses, if done well, could help to simulate a real classroom situation and would remind correspondence students that they are not alone in their efforts to complete the course assignments. Television would also be useful in visually or graphically showing a number of **abstract** concepts that correspondence students have found difficult to grasp through printed materials alone.

The associations identified the needs of correspondence students as being greatest in the more **northern** and **remote** parts of the country. Most of these students do not have the opportunity to attend classroom lectures, and yet many associations that have chapters in these areas have a responsibility to serve members located there. Fulfilling that responsiblity has been very costly for a number of associations and they therefore view broadcast courses as a way to serve these groups.

Three associations said that television could contribute to the availability of their **continuing education** courses, and would allow larger numbers of members to pursue professional development. The associations suggested that these individuals would not have to enroll in the entire course, for instance, but could learn about the more recent changes in their industry by watching the television programs.

Adequate and easy access is also a problem for the advanced courses that are highly specialized. Many associations stated that students have the most difficulty gaining access to their highly specialized courses (such as advanced accounting or taxation for accounting associations or appraisal courses for the *Ontario Real Estate Association*). These specialized courses are developed directly by the associations and are not readily available through universities and community colleges. The idea of a television option for these specialized courses greatly appeals to the majority of the associations (10 in total), but they recognize that the student numbers involved (usually only between 15 and 35 per course at any one time in many cases) are simply too small to justify the production costs of specialized broadcast courses. However, some associations do have extremely extensive numbers for specialized courses, and each subject should be explored on a case-by-case basis.

Other Academic Concerns

The respondents were also asked about the required criteria they require to ensure that the courses they approve are of high academic quality. This was difficult for them to respond to, largely because no specific programming proposals have been developed at this point. Most of the associations said that they could better answer this question only on a course by course proposal basis, where issues of specific academic content were addressed. Nevertheless, nine of the associations prefer to have courses that are developed at the **university level**. This was the stated preference of associations that do not

currently recognize university degrees as a necessary requirement for their members and even by those who have no plans to make a degree a requirement.

The *Institute of Chartered Accountants of Ontario* (ICAO), which does have a degree prerequisite, was concerned about the **number of academic hours** which televised courses could provide for their students. ICAO students must satisfy a specified number of academic course hours in addition to completing assignments, writing examinations, and any other forms of evaluation. One-hour television programs broadcast on a weekly basis would not satisfy the three-hour classroom requirement that four associations currently demand. Television programs that supplement classroom hours could be an alternative option, however.

Standardized content and delivery was mentioned by four associations as being desirable and some associations were concerned as to how this could be ensured through television.

Instructional Design Preferences

A number of associations reported that their courses which utilize **case study** methodologies would be best suited to television. Case studies offer a great deal of potential for students to criticize, compare, and discuss the different approaches presented. It is an approach that can be equally productive in a correspondence delivery mode or in a classroom discussion situation.

Two other associations were specifically insistent that **talking heads** be kept to a minimum in any programs that are developed. The associations described their members as people who are accustomed to viewing very sophisticated television programming and using sophisticated audiovisual productions in the business world. These professionals would not be attracted to educational programs that are not of high visual quality. At the same time, the associations recognized that such programming is more expensive and requires larger student markets.

In addition to bringing another dimension to correspondence courses, eight associations also stated that television might appeal to a potentially larger student market. None of the associations could speculate on how large that market might actually be, but several stated

that there probably were students who would prefer to take a course by television rather than attend classes, and that they would like to attract these potential students to their programs.

University Views on Associateship and Fellowship Programs

In order to better understand the implications involved in developing productions that support associateship and fellowship level programs, the continuing education programs of two universities were contacted. The *Independent Study Program* through the University of Toronto's School of Continuing Studies and the University of Windsor's *Office for Continuing Education* both offer courses that are approved and officially recognized by various associations towards their advanced level associateship and fellowship programs. Other colleges and universities in the province also offer similar programs.

The *Independent Study Program* is affiliated with nine of the associations in this study, but also cooperates with a number of other associations that approve the program's generic business courses. None of the courses are for university degree credit, but all are eligible for credit towards a professional associateship, fellowship or certificate designation. At the moment, all of the independent study courses are in the correspondence format and utilize print and audio cassette media. The program is investigating teleconferencing, television and video media to enrich the learning experience of their students.

There are currently 3,020 students enrolled in the courses offered through this program, but registration is expected to expand to 4,500 or 5,000 over the next couple of years as a result of improved interactive supports. Although the majority of students are Canadian, the program also has international registrants. The majority of students taking courses through the *Independent Study Program* are pursuing a professional designation. Although some of these students already have a university degree, the majority do not.

Unlike the *Independent Study Program*, the *Continuing Education Program* at the University of Windsor offers both degree-credit and nondegree-credit correspondence coures. Walter Eugama, the program's director, explained that television would be attractive to Windsor's program if it were part of a multi-media approach. A methodology that offers one-way visual communication in conjunction with two-way audio interaction, perhaps as a half-hour

phone-in period at the end of a broadcast, would be most attractive. McKay concurred with this view by saying that television would be a very valuable method for enhancing most of his program's courses if combined with other interactive media, such as computers and teleconferencing.

Not surprising, given their institutional affiliations, both McKay and Eugama expressed a bias towards courses that are noncredit, but still associated with a university. For them, noncredit courses offered by universities are of higher academic quality and are better suited to the educational needs of the business people who take them than are comparative courses offered by community colleges.

McKay has already approached TVOntario about the possibility of developing cooperative broadcast courses for the associateship and fellowship levels. Programs such as the *Independent Study Program* have many advantages for cooperation that TVOntario may wish to consider; for instance, well-developed contacts with several of the associations already exist. Evaluation procedures and basic instructor-student interaction supports are already in place. The administrative capacity to handle student registrations, student inquiries, examinations, and so on, are established. In addition, the *Independent Study Program's* courses are designed by university faculty that would be brought to any joint production venture with TVOntario.

Other universities and colleges also have similar arrangements as those of the *Independent Study Program* and the *Office for Continuing Education* at the University of Windsor. If TVOntario decides to produce programming for the fellowship and associateship levels, it would be very important to investigate these other programs further, and to really compare the advantages and disadvantages of working with each before choosing partners.

Options with Nonprofessional Associations

Additional options may exist to form partnerships with associations that are not necessarily certifying bodies, but whose members are the professional educators in certain fields. For instance, the *Institute of Public Administration of Canada* (IPAC) acts as a national professional interest group between 3,000 to 3,500 members who are either public servants, professors and lecturers of public administration or students of this subject.

IPAC is not a certifying association and members do not achieve any type of professional designation through membership. Nevertheless, IPAC's members are highly credentialed and within IPAC, there is a subcommittee called the *Canadian Association of Public Administration* (CAPA) which is composed of faculty members from a variety of public administration programs around the country. According to CAPA's president, Professor Sanford Borins of York University, there is great potential for, and interest in, developing broadcast courses in public administration. For instance, the faculty has been interested in developing student assignments around such programs as *Yes, Minister!*, *Executive Suite*, and *Wall Street* .

In addition, IPAC has published over 60 different case studies examining various ethical dilemmas in public administration. More than 10,000 copies of these case studies are sold each year and Borins believes these sales indicate a substantial market for alternative educational materials in public administration.

TVOntario's Image as a Business Educator

Response to TVOntario's image as a supplier of business programming from twelve associations was that their members would look very favorably on TVOntario as a provider of credible business education broadcasting, particularly if it were made clear that TVOntario was working jointly with academic institutions to provide officially-approved educational programming. All felt that TVOntario's reputation as an educational broadcaster was unsurpassed and many mentioned programs like *Money$Worth* and *The Successful Landlord*, as evidence of TVOntario's expertise in these areas.

This positive view of TVOntario parallels the findings of a 1984 Planning and Development Research report by Judith Tobin (Project Leader), and Jo Ellen Logan, Thelma Rosen and Michelle Kosoy (Research Officers). While that report concentrated on the feasibility of producing nonbroadcast, multimedia independent study packages for management training for a wider professional base, it also found that TVO's image as a potential provider of professional training was positive [1].

As well, the findings of the current study correspond to findings in a market positioning study by Edward Withers (1987). Withers suggested that, for marketing purposes of accredited programming, TVOntario would initially be best advised to show that its services stand in some

"specified relationship to the offerings of a recognized consensus leader" [2] in business education, such as a university.

Cost

The issue of cost was not raised in the interview process because the study was in a preliminary stage of research. Thirteen of the associations did not raise it on their own or identify it as a potential problem to forming partnerships. However, the two associations that were moderately responsive to further discussion with TVOntario were particularly concerned about the cost involved in any type of joint effort. These associations have very little funding of their own and, therefore, wanted to make their situation known at the outset before engaging in any further consideration process.

These two associations had been previously approached by an independent producer, who was attempting to raise financial support for a production on investment banking. TVOntario was associated with this proposal, and these two associations wanted to make it very clear that they were not in a position to commit financial support. Nevertheless, the fact that 13 of the 17 associations did not identify cost as an obstacle to forming joint partnerships should be viewed positively.

PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS IN FORMING PARTNERSHIPS

The needs and interests of the different associations pose a number of practical implications for TVOntario's involvement in joint production efforts. This section outlines each of these various practical implications in detail.

Key Findings:

- Student numbers influence the market size for business education broadcasting. The largest student markets are found in the specialized introductory and intermediate programs and in some specialized advanced courses. Large markets for generic courses also exist if student numbers for the associateship and fellowship levels are taken collectively.

- The associations' national responsibilities require arrangements for national broadcast distribution and French language programming.

- The preference for courses with university affiliation and perceived university academic status implies that any broadcasting to be developed would be more marketable if affiliated with a university.

- Certain generic business courses are required by most of the associateship and fellowship programs of the different associations, while other courses are in less demand. The demand for generic courses may affect TVOntario's choices in program development.

- The demand for interactive support implies that TVOntario may be expected to work directly with associations to provide interactive services.

- Flexiblity is also required so that the same programs can be used by both correspondence learners and in-class students. The role of the in-class instructor, course revision requirements, and instructional design preferences are all factors affecting program flexibility.

- Different associations will have different administrative and organizational capacities which may affect TVOntario's choice of partners. Ability to share production costs will also vary among the associations and alternative sources of funding support may be necessary.

- The considerable level of enthusiasm and the timeliness of the research indicates a strong demand for business broadcasting that requires a quick response.

Student Market Size

Large student numbers are an important factor for TVOntario's consideration since large student numbers imply large markets for TVOntario programming in specific subjects. In this study, the associations reported having the largest student numbers in their introductory and intermediate programs. If TVOntario chooses to work directly with individual associations, the largest programming markets would probably be found for the introductory and intermediate levels.

All of the associations reported that their student enrolment numbers decline at the higher associateship and fellowship levels. Several of the associations perceived these small students numbers as a factor that would limit TVOntario's interest in developing joint productions for these levels. However, since most of the associations recognize or approve the generic business courses that are provided by various colleges and universities for these advanced programs, on a collective basis there would be large student markets for broadcast courses in a number of the generic subject areas. TVOntario could work directly with these colleges and universities to provide broadcast courses in these generic subject areas.

Key implication: *It would be easiest to begin cooperative productions for the subjects that have the largest numbers of students. Large student numbers are available in the introductory or intermediate programs of individual associations as well as in the associateship or fellowship programs that are collectively recognized by a number of associations.*

National Responsibilities

TVOntario needs to address the potential for programming distribution beyond Ontario, considering that 11 out of 17 associations have national responsibilities and members in other provinces. These associations require additional arrangements for their members to obtain access to any educational programming that is produced. This could be done either through additional video options, arrangements with other broadcasters, direct marketing to affiliated educational institutions, and so on. National distribution also involves the provision of programming in both of Canada's official languages, something TVOntario is well-suited to achieve through the participation of La Chaîne. The national scope for such programming also supports the proposal for a national education network.

Key implication: *In order to form partnerships with the majority of associations, TVOntario will need to explore ways in which their programs are made available nationally and in both French and English.*

University Status

As stated earlier, the courses offered by the continuing education programs of universities are considered to be of higher academic quality and status than are those offered by colleges. Thirteen of the associations specified that university-affiliated courses provide a better education and a better edge in the labor market for the students who complete them.

For any programming developed by TVOntario in the traditional or generic subjects of business education (accounting, economics, finance, marketing, and so on), it would be an important market positioning tactic to work jointly with a university.

Key Implication: *To develop programming for the advanced fellowship and associateship level markets and in order to ensure that the academic quality of its programs are recognized, TVOntario would be advised to seek affiliation with one or more universities that provide generic business courses.*

Generic Course Distribution

Another important consideration involves the extent to which the various **generic** business courses are a part of the associateship or fellowship programs of the different associations. If TVOntario is interested in developing programming for this educational level, it is important to know which courses are in most demand among all the associations and perhaps to begin programming production for these subjects first. Chart #3 lists the majority of generic courses and the number of associations contacted in this study that include the course in their associateship or fellowship programs:

Chart #3: Distribution of Generic Courses Among the Associations

Subject	Number of Associations that include the course
• Accounting	12
• Financial Management	12
• Business or Commercial Law	11
• Economics	11
• Organizational Behavior	8
• Marketing	7
• Administration	7
• Business Communications	7
• Business Statistics	7
• Business Policy or Strategy	7
• Business Computer Applications	7
• Human Resource/Personnel Management	6
• Business Taxation	4
• International Economics	4
• Management Accounting	4
• Managing Information Systems	4

Key Implication: *When developing productions for the associateship and fellowship levels, TVOntario may wish to begin with the generic courses that are most in demand among all the associations. According to the above table, these subjects are accounting, financial management, business or commercial law, and economics.*

Interaction

The need for constructive **interaction** between learners and instructors/tutors was identified as being very important by many of the associations. In fact, the potential for interaction was identified as being more important than having an extra visual dimension to courses through television. At the time of the interviews, at least seven associations were investigating the possibility of developing teleconferencing capabilities, computer networking, support groups or other mentoring systems as ways of providing additional forms of interaction and problem-solving for their student members.

While the associations recognize that TVOntario would not be responsible for organizing and implementing an interactive dimension to the various courses, they would like to see TVOntario design the productions to facilitate some type of interaction.

Key implication: *TVOntario will need to address the interactive requirement in further negotiations with specific institutions and associations, as well as within the instructional design of any programs that are jointly produced.*

Role of the Instructor

As a corollary to the need for interaction, broadcast courses need to be sensitive to the traditional role of the instructor. The findings from this study indicate that there is a need mainly for broadcast programming to enhance existing print-based correspondence courses. However, there is also the potential for broadcast courses to supplement or reinforce in-class instruction, and this potential raises other implications.

The literature suggests that educational institutions still have a number of concerns about broadcast courses. There is a fear that the role of the instructor or faculty member will be denigrated through the use of television since instructional technology gives the student more control of the learning process [3].

As well, the literature indicates that telecourses involve different teaching loads than do regular classroom instruction and this has become a critical issue in the use of many coordinated instructional sytems. If the faculty member has had no part in developing the course and becomes instead only a "learning manager" or resource person and provides nothing but telephone support to distance learners, then major questions are raised about the proper status of that instructor [4].

The associations in this study view direct broadcast courses as another option available to students who perhaps cannot access available classroom instruction. They did not express concern about the instructor's position, because the majority of associations suspect that classroom instruction is still the preferred method of learning for most of their students. However, they are interested in broadcast courses as a way to extend educational opportunities to potential students, who cannot currently take advantage of the existing classroom-based opportunities.

Key implication: *In some instances, a televised methodology that delivers courses directly or that enhances correspondence courses may be viewed as eroding the role of the instructor in classroom teaching. Sensitivity to the role of the instructor may be required during the negotiation process with the associations. It is best for TVOntario to stress that it is interested in partnerships for the purpose of enhancing or extending existing educational opportunities, rather than competing with existing options.*

Revision Procedures

Courses that require continual revision would be difficult to produce given the lead time necessary for program development. It is possible that the content of such programs could be out of date by the time they are ready to air. For all courses, programming should concentrate on producing core segments that do not change as readily or become obsolete as quickly.

Key implication: *Because of the cost and time involved in producing educational broadcasting, production should be designed to include the aspects of each course that are not subject to frequent revision.*

Instructional Design Preferences

A majority of associations in this study reported that programming which utilizes a case study methodology would best suit their members' needs. As well, colorful graphs and charts and sophisticated graphics would enliven programs that concentrate on more abstract subjects such as accounting and economics. Overuse of talking heads should also be avoided.

Key implication: *To ensure that the associations are as receptive as possible to the productions when completed, TVOntario should heed the instructional preferences they have identified.*

Administrative Factors

Educational institutions are also concerned about the administrative factors involved in coordinating broadcasting courses [5]. The literature indicates that issues related to student registration and the coordination of broadcast times and dates with lecture scheduling would require careful organization and would be difficult to work out if a large number of educational institutions are involved [6].

The importance that associations place on the value of interaction would require TVOntario to organize its broadcast scheduling of these courses in a way that facilitates or coincides with the various interactive options that the associations might arrange.

Moreover, the amount of administrative work for TVOntario would probably vary depending on which educational level the broadcasts are designed for. Productions targetted for the introductory and intermediate levels, for instance, would be developed directly with individual associations through one-on-one bilateral administrative and organizational arrangements. The same arrangements would be involved if TVOntario were to cooperate with individual educational institutions to produce broadcast courses for the fellowship and associateship levels. The most administrative effort would be required if TVOntario were to initiate multilateral arrangements with a number of associations for each production.

Key implication: *The administrative mechanisms required for joint productions will vary in complexity depending on the educational level the programs are designed for and the number of cooperating groups involved in each production.*

Cost

Willingness to discuss production costs is also an important criterion for partnership developments. The associations, which have already clearly shown concern over their inability to contribute to production costs, are unlikely partners to be approached for this purpose. However, the associateship and fellowship student numbers of these groups still represent a paying market that may register for broadcast courses if programs are produced. Additional funding sources may be available to supplement the production costs of programs for these groups (such as government sources, businesses within each industry, and so on), particularly if the industries they represent and their educational programs correspond directly to training needs currently required in the economy.

Key implication: *Production costs will need to be more explicitly discussed during partnership negotiations. Additional sources of production financing may also be sought either from business or appropriate government ministries to supplement the programs of other groups, which do not have sufficient funds for production.*

Timeliness and Level of Enthusiasm

It is easier to negotiate partnership arrangements with associations that are already very enthusiastic and interested in the idea, and may consider it a timely opportunity for their own initiatives and plans. In this study, a number of associations reported that they had been wanting to approach TVOntario for this same purpose. Others said that they were in the process of researching and investigating a variety of educational media to assist them in their educational programs, so that the idea of forming joint partnerships for educational television productions strongly appealled to them at present.

Key implication: *This investigation was viewed as being very timely by several associations. A speedy response to this timeliness would be to TVOntario's own advantage, if business education broadcasting is to be pursued.*

CREDENTIALISM

A number of different issues are involved in examining the value of credentialism. One factor is the extent to which adult learners value official recognition for the courses they take. The literature shows that receiving official recognition is very important for most adult learners [7].

A distinction must be made between the value of different types of credentials. Each credential has a different value in the marketplace, for postsecondary educators, and for adult learners. For TVOntario, successful partnership choices will depend on the actual credential involved. It is likely that programs which lead to highly-valued credentials will be more successful and have higher enrolment rates.

This section of the report therefore reviews the importance of credentialism from four main perspectives: (i) in postsecondary education; (ii) in the marketplace; (iii) for students; and (iv) for professional associations.

Key Findings:

- For the most part, credentialism is still defined very narrowly in many formal postsecondary education circles. University credentials are perceived to have higher educational value than college credentials.

- However, postsecondary educators are also recognizing that community college credentials are currently underrated in the workplace. As a result, changes to the community college education system are being proposed by the provincial *Vision 2000* investigation. These changes would allow students to pursue a combination of college and university credits that would better prepare them for the marketplace.

- At the same time, employers still prefer university credentials to credentials of community colleges.

- The literature shows that there is a difference between the type of credentials pursued by the majority of full-time students and that of part-time learners. High full-time university enrolment rates indicate that the majority of those individuals with the option of studying full-time prefer degree credentials.

- Greater numbers of part-time adult learners are enrolled in the continuing education courses of community colleges.

- Professional associations also assign greater status to courses offered by universities than they do to courses of community colleges.

Value of Credentialism in Formal Education

Credentialism is still defined very narrowly in most postsecondary education circles. A clear distinction is made between education that leads to diplomas or certificates from Ontario's Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology (CAATs) and that which leads to a university degree. Greater status is usually attached to university credentials.

However, a provincial investigation, *Vision 2000*, has recently re-examined the rationale for this distinction and has reassessed the future mandate of the CAATs. In focusing on the needs of Ontario's economy, *Vision 2000* revealed that community colleges have had difficulty providing the appropriate mix of education and technological skills currently required in the marketplace. Ontario's economy has changed far more quickly and dramatically than the colleges have during the 25 years since they were introduced and as a result, the CAATs have not been able to provide the most appropriate type of education needed in the marketplace [8].

The difference between college credentials and university credentials lies in the focus of their programs, not the quality of their courses. University degree courses are commonly understood to emphasize the theory, structure, and process of a field or subject whereas college courses focus more on the job skills needed to work in a particular field [9].

One of the recommendations of *Vision 2000* has, therefore, been to broaden the scope of college education. In addition to technological

skills, changes are proposed so that college students receive a liberal arts education and learn life skills and problem-solving skills, reading, and computer literacy skills, in conjunction with their technological education.

To meet the future needs of Ontario's economy, *Vision 2000* recommends further that combined college/university programs in centres of excellence should be established that would allow students to pursue the best technological and academic courses in a specific discipline. Strong cooperative linkages with business, industry, and unions have also been proposed to ensure that combined programs are relevant and meet the needs of industry [10].

The need for combined college/university programs would necessitate the creation of academic bridges between existing college and university programs and would further involve mechanisms for standardization and transferability of college courses among CAATs and from colleges to universities [11]. These changes would lessen the distinction that currently exists between university credits and college credits. Official recognition for work experience would allow students to receive advanced standing in certain credits as well [12].

Value of Credentialism to Employers

A review of how the marketplace values various credentials also reveals that a clear distinction exists between the employment value of university degrees and CAAT diplomas or certficates. Although employers state that quality of work experience is more important to them than formal credentials, studies show that university graduates advance more quickly in the workplace than do employees in the same job or profession who possess a college diploma or certificate. Although college and university graduates may enter the workforce at the same level and with the same amount of work experience, college graduates are not promoted as often as university graduates nor are they usually viewed as potential managers [13].

Because of this differential market value, Michael Skolnik of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, defines credentialism as "the practice of selecting individuals for entry to certain job fields, or advancement within those fields, on the basis of their formal educational qualifications even though the specific content of their education may not be absolutely required for performance of the tasks

involved in their jobs" [14]. The result is that college credentials may not be given an appropriate value in the marketplace, and therefore college graduates are penalized in their careers for their initial postsecondary education choice. Another serious result is that society may be prevented from achieving the best utilization of the productive potential of many college graduates.

Value of Credentialism to Students

Since this study did not involve primary, original research with students enrolled in the programs offered by professional associations, no direct responses of how students value credentialism were obtained. Nevertheless, the literature review process did reveal some information in this regard and a few assumptions may be made as a result.

For example, a 1976 study by Ignacy Waniewicz (former director of the Office of Planning and Development, TVOntario) explored the reasons for adult part-time learning in Ontario and included findings that offer some insights. At that time, 59% of the respondents, who were already studying part-time, stated that receiving some type of official recognition for their studies was important. Of these, 38% desired credit towards a professional vocational certificate; 32% desired certification for satisfactorily completing a course; 19% were striving toward university accreditation. The remaining 11% were interested in other forms of official recognition [15].

In recent years, career-related goals have become more important for adult learners. In 1976, 33% of learners were studying for job advancement, to improve employment requirements, or to obtain increased financial benefits [16]. According to the 1986 Census Canada data, however, 77% of adult students pursue degrees for career-related reasons [17]. A 1989 Statistics Canada survey indicated four main reasons why adults study: 29% wish to prepare for a first career; 33% study to improve their existing career; 10% study in order to make a career change; and 10% study to improve their earnings [18]. Since the percentage of learners with career-related goals has increased since Waniewicz's 1976 report, it may be possible to assume that the percentage of learners desiring official recogntion towards professional vocational certificates has also increased since that time.

Since employment and career goals are a high priority for adult students, it follows that adults will make educational choices based on the programs that are most likely to allow them to achieve these goals, provided that their own abilities and life situation allow them to choose those options. Although there is a preference for university credentials, not all adult learners can access university programs. Greater opportunities for part-time education leading to professional designations may exist through community colleges so adult learners enroll in college programs even though they would possibly prefer comparable university-affiliated programs, if such courses were more readily available to them.

An examination of changing enrolment trends supports this view. It is interesting to note that the enrolment trends in colleges and universities have been changing drastically in recent years. These changes reflect the changing value of various credentials in the marketplace and their corresponding value to adult students.

On the one hand, while full-time university enrolments continue to increase, full-time registrations in CAAT postsecondary programs have been declining for several years [19]. However, the opposite trend is observed when part-time enrolments are examined. Part-time college registrations are almost double the number in the university sector (758,021 versus 398,143) [20]. A 1987 study found that there were approximately five part-time college students for every full-time student [21], two-thirds of whom are in vocationally-oriented programs. The *Vision 2000* investigation acknowledges the trend to part-time education and has made strong recommendations to upgrade and improve the opportunities for part-time students to pursue continuing education [22].

Value of Credentialism to Professional Associations

Professional associations are also aware of how the marketplace values different credentials. Until recently, most professional and paraprofessional associations accepted approved courses completed at colleges and universities. Now, however, a number of these associations are currently reconsidering their own valuing of credentialism and in some cases are in the process of establishing university degrees as a mandatory entrance requirement.

The province's differential funding for part-time programs [23] also has important implications for professional associations since they are associated with part-time programs. Although the associations may prefer university affiliation, more provincial support is going to part-time college programs. This poses as a dilemma wherein associations prefer university affiliation but have more options for program support in the college system.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, the overall findings of this research indicate that there is substanial interest and sufficient need on the part of many associations for additional delivery methods mainly to enhance both their correspondence courses. Cooperating with TVOntario to produce broadcast courses is definitely viewed as a very attractive way to achieve this objective by many of the associations. Reaching new student audiences is another benefit. Every educational level: introductory, intermediate, and advanced associateship or fellowship programs would benefit from this approach and three different partnership options are possible as a result.

However, cooperative productions would involve a number of implications for both the associations and TVOntario directly. Programs would require national distribution. Ways to improve student-tutor/instructor interaction are also desirable. Other implications involve the comparative organizational responsiblities of the associations and of TVOntario.

TVOntario is viewed as being very capable of providing valuable business programming. However, the credibility of business education broadcasts would be enhanced if such programs are produced in conjunction with a recognized accredited institution and with experts from these institutions. As well, considering that the value of various credentials is changing, it would be worthwhile for TVOntario to develop productions that are suitable for both college and university environments.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX I

CONTACT LIST

1. ***Administrative Management Society***
   Bernice Taviner (Coordinator: Certified Administrative Managers Program)

2. ***Canadian Institute of Certified Administrative Managers***
   Mr. Ballantyne (Director)

3. ***Canadian Institute of Credit and Financial Management***
   Dave Nichols (Education Director)

4. ***Canadian Credit Union Institute***
   Charlotte Ewbank (Training Manager: Fellows' Program)

5. ***Canadian Institute of Customs House Brokers***
   Mr. Kelly Stewart (Administrator: Academic Services)

6. ***Canadian Institute of Management***
   Joan Milne (Executive Director)

7. ***Canadian Institute of Traffic and Transportation***
   Sue McMillan (Program Administrator)

8. ***Canadian Institute of Travel Counsellors***
   Coralie Belman (Seminar Coordinator)

9. ***Certified General Accountants of Ontario***
   Debbie Boyce (Education Coordinator)

10. ***Institute of Canadian Bankers***
    Mark Webb (Education Coordinator)

11. ***Institute of Chartered Accountants of Ontario***
    Kass Abrahim (Director of Education) and
    Dave Scott (Television Production)

12. ***Insurance Institute of Canada Fellowship Program***
    J.C. Rhind (President)

13. ***Ontario Real Estate Association***
    Don Richardson (Director of Education)

14. ***Personnel Association of Ontario***
    Janet Edwards (Coordinator: Certificate in Personnel Management)

15. ***Purchasing Management Association of Canada***
    Carol Ship-Spencer (Education Director)

16. *Society of Management Accountants*
Doreen Wilson (Director of Students)

17. *Trust Companies Institute*
Debbie Bell (Program Director of Education)

The following additional contacts were also made and are of relevance to the study.

18. *Independent Study Programme, School of Continuing Studies University of Toronto*
Archie McKay (Director)

19. *Office of Continuing Education, University of Windsor*
Walter Eugama (Director)

20. *Institute of Public Administration of Canada*
Prof. Sanford Borins (President: Canadian Association of Public Administration – a subcommittee of IPAC)

APPENDIX II

REFERENCES

1 Tobin, Judith, Jo Ellen Logan, Thelma Rosen, and Michelle Kosoy. *Report on a Study to Determine the Feasibility of Developing a Series of Nonbroadcast, Multimedia Independent Study Packages for Management Training* (Toronto: TVOntario, Office of Development Research, April 1984).

2 Withers, Edward. *Market Action Academy Positioning - Executive Summary* (Toronto: TVOntario, Market Research, April 1987).

3 Munshi, Kiki Skagen. "Mass Media and Continuing Education: An Overview." *New Directions for Continuing Education* (no. 5. 1980): 12.

4 Ibid., 12.

5 Ibid.

6 Ibid.

7 Waniewicz, Ignacy. *Demand for Part-Time Learning in Ontario* (Toronto: TVOntario, The Ontario Educational Communications Authority, 1976): 105.

8 *Ottawa Citizen*. "Reforming Our Colleges - A Bold, Sweeping Blueprint." Wednesday, July 25, 1990.

9 LeSage, E.C. Jr. "Public Administration Continuing Education in Canada," in *Canadian Public Administration*, 32 (no. 4. Winter, 1989): 593.

10 Ainsworth, Lynn. "Ontario's Community Colleges Try to Shake 'Second Rate' Image." *Toronto Star*, Thursday, May 24, 1990 and Claire Bickley. "College Shake-up Urged." *Toronto Sun*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

11 Papp, Leslie. "Drastic Reforms Urged at Community Colleges." *Toronto Star*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

12 Bickley, Claire. "College Shake-up Urged." *Toronto Sun*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

13 Anisef, Paul; Frederick D. Ashbury; and Anton H. Turrittin. *"Educational Diversity and Occupational Attainment: Are Community Colleges Fulfilling their Promise?"* cited in Michael Skolnik, "How Ontario's College System Might Respond to Pressures for the Provisions of More Advanced Training." *Vision 2000, Study Team 5* (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, October 1989): 9.

14 Skolnik, Michael. "How Ontario's College System Might Respond to Pressures for the Provisions of More Advanced Training." *Vision 2000, Study Team 5* (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, October 1989): 2.

15 Waniewicz, op.cit., p. 103.

16 Ibid., 82.

17 Ibid., 32.

18 Statistics Canada, *Preliminary Data Cycle 4: Education and Work* (Ottawa: Statistics Canada, General Social Survey, 1989): 16.

19 Skolnik, op.cit., p. 2.

20 Study Team 1, "The College System -- An Empirical Snapshot," *Vision 2000* (Toronto: Council of Regents, October, 1989): 35.

21 Wismer, Susan. 1989. Towards the Year 2000: Communities Within Colleges. *Vision 2000* (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents): 4.

22 Papp, op.cit.

23 Wismer, op.cit. p. 4.

APPENDIX III

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ainsworth, Lynn. "Ontario's Community Colleges Try to Shake 'Second Rate' Image." *Toronto Star*, Thursday, May 24, 1990.

Allan, George. *Alternative Delivery of Instruction in Post-Compulsory Education.* Vision 2000, Study Team 4 (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

Aspinall, Francie. *Meeting the Needs of Increasingly Diverse Learners: Submissions from Community Organizations and the Colleges.* Vision 2000, Study Team 3 (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

Beder, Hal. "Basic Concepts and Principles of Marketing." *New Directions for Continuing Education*: 31 (Fall 1986).

Bélanger, Rebecca and Teresa Omiecinski. "Part-time University Enrolment." *Canadian Social Trends* (Summer 1987).

Bickley, Claire. "College Shake-up Urged." *Toronto Sun*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

Campbell, Sandra; Francine Lecoupe; and Judith Tobin. *Distance Education Committee Initiative: An Overview of the Process and Outcome* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, November 1988).

Campbell, Sandra; Audrey Mehler; Donna Sharon; and Judith Tobin. *Trends and Their Implications for Planning in Part-time Learning* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, October 1986).

Canadian Association for Adult Education. *An Analysis of the Statistics Canada Adult Education Survey — January 1984* (Toronto: Canadian Association for Adult Education, March 31, 1985).

"Colleges Should Teach More Life Skills: Report." *Ottawa Citizen*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

Deveraux, Mary Sue. *One in Every Five — A Survey of Adult Education in Canada* (Ottawa: Joint Publication by Statistics Canada and the Education Support Sector, Department of Secretary of State, 1984).

Devereaux, Mary Sue and Douglas J. Higgins. "Part-time Adult Training." *Canadian Social Trends* (Winter 1988).

Falk, Charles F. "Promoting Continuing Education Programs." *New Directions for Continuing Education:* 31 (Fall 1986).

Foot, David and Maia MacNiven. *The Determinants of Enrolment Rates and Enrolments in Ontario Community Colleges.* Vision 2000, Study Team 1 (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

French, Orland. "Broader Curriculum Urged for Colleges." *Globe and Mail*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

Honsberger, Harv. *Quality: From an Instructional Perspective*. Vision 2000, Study Team 4 (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

Kelly, Kevin. "Why Business is Glued to the Tube." *Business Week* (March 20, 1989).

Knox, Alan B. "Designing Comprehensive Programs in Adult and Continuing Education," *New Directions for Continuing Education:* 44 (Winter 1989).

LeSage, E.C. Jr. "Public Administration Continuing Education in Canada." *Canadian Public Administration:* 32 (no.4. Winter, 1989).

Mason, Robert C. "Locating Continuing Education Programs." *New Directions for Continuing Education*: 31(Fall 1986).

Ministry of Colleges and Universities. *Horizons: 1989/90 Guide to Postsecondary Education in Ontario*. (Toronto, 1989).

Mishler, Carol J. "Adults' Perceptions of the Benefits of a College Degree." *Research in Higher Education:* 19 (no.2, 1983).

Moore, Michael G. "Recruiting and Retaining Adult Students in Distance Education," *New Directions for Continuing Education* (no. 41, Spring 1989).

Munshi, Kiki Skagen. "Mass Media and Continuing Education: An Overview." *New Directions for Continuing Education* (no. 5, 1980).

Niemi, John A. "Strengthening the Field's Impact Within Institutions of Higher Education." *New Directions for Continuing Education* (no. 44, Winter 1989).

Papp, Leslie. "Drastic Reforms Urged at Community Colleges." *Toronto Star*, Saturday, July 21, 1990.

Park, Michael. *Expanding the Core: General Education, Generic Skills, and Core Curriculum in Ontario Community Colleges*. Vision 2000, Study Team 4 (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

Premier's Council Report. *People And Skills in the New Global Economy: Report in Brief* (Toronto: Queen's Park, 1990).

Premier's Council Report. *People And Skills in the New Global Economy* (Toronto: Queen's Park, 1990).

Protz, Maria and Judith Tobin. *Business Training: Content, Enrollment and Delivery*. (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, February 1990).

"Reforming Our Colleges — A Bold, Sweeping Blueprint." *Ottawa Citizen*, Wednesday, July 25, 1990.

Sharon, Donna; Revital Marom; and Anita Sheth. *TVOntario and the School System.* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, July 1990).

Sharon, Donna; Sandra Campbell; Francine Lecoupe; and Judith Tobin. *Technology in Education I* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, October 1987).

Sharon, Donna; Sandra Campbell; Judith Tobin and Edward Withers. *Technology in Education II* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, April 1988).

Skolnik, Michael. *How Ontario's College System Might Respond to Pressures for the Provision of More Advanced Training.* Vision 2000, Study Team 5 (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

Smith, Wendell L. "Defining and Analyzing the Market." *New Directions for Continuing Education:* 31 (Fall 1986).

Taylor, John. *Visions of Educational Technology in the Year 2000.* Vision 2000, Study Team 4 (Toronto, Ontario Council of Regents, 1990).

Tobin, Judith; Thelma Rosen; Jo Ellen Logan; and Michelle Kosoy. *Feasibility Study on Management Training Through Independent Study* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, May 1984).

Tobin, Judith; Thelma Rosen; Jo Ellen Logan; and Michelle Kosoy. *Proposal for Development of a Learning Package on Supervisory Skills* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, May 1984).

Tobin, Judith. *Educational Funding Trends* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, 1989).

Tobin, Judith; Thelma Rosen Berris; Sandra Campbell; Howard Krosnick; Francine Lecoupe; and Donna Sharon. *External Environment Papers* (Toronto: TVOntario, Planning and Development Research, April 1988).

Waniewicz, Ignacy. *Demand for Part-Time Learning in Ontario* (Toronto: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 1976).

Willard, Joyce C. and Lee A. Warren. "Developing Program Offerings." *New Directions for Continuing Education*: 31 (Fall 1986).

Wiesner, Peter. "Utilizing Television." *New Directions for Continuing Education:* 34 (Summer 1987).

Wismer, Susan. *Ontario's Community Colleges: Values for the Year 2000.* Vision 2000, Background Papers (Toronto: Ontario Council of Regents, January 1990).

Withers, Edward. *Market Action Academy Positioning — Executive Summar* (Toronto: TVOntario, Market Research, April 1987).